

1630 hours

SHRI TATHAGATA SATPATHY (DHENKANAL): I am a troubled man today because as Members of the highest temple of democracy we are supposed to be giving solutions to the people of this country.

(f3/1630/spr-ind)

But we see the impatience; we see the carelessness; we see the arrogance; and we see their attitude of one sidedness. When this whole nation is watching us that what solutions do these leaders put up before the nation during these discussions, these very delicate discussions, concerning the youth, concerning the democracy, concerning terrorism. Here, we are a bunch of people shouting and screaming at each other, and unable to actually address the real problems. It is sad, and while sitting here, and patiently listening to all sides, I am heartbroken to say that the youth of this country does not deserve us. We are the most undeserving set of people to be in this House today.

We were supposed to carry out this discussion tomorrow, Madam. I do not know what was the great hurry of mudslinging from both sides. One side demands, and the other side accepts that we had to move it earlier. I am not interested in taking sides with any of these Parties. I am interested to hear, and I wish to sit till the end of these discussions to hear who has a word of solace, who proves that he or she has a point of solution to the problems that the nation is facing today.

Is it only votes that matter? Is it only us and them? Are we not simplifying matters by breaking the country up into two parts – us and them? If you love your country, you love me. If you don't love me, you don't love the country. So by dividing the country in this manner, we are creating a bunch of people whose petty, political ambitions are to be assuaged, are to be satisfied at the cost, a heavy cost to the country. I would like to quote Voltaire, who said: "I disapprove of what you say, but I will defend to the death your right to say it."

The Government refused the help of the Pakistan army. They said that they have easier access to Siachen; they will reach our post quicker; and they will save our soldiers. The Government refused. And for six days, the young men of our Army were under 25 feet of snow. There was one braveheart – that is the word being used – one brave soldier with tenacity and love for his motherland, who survived. He was brought to the hospital. Then I do not know whom amongst us he saw, that he gave up his last breathe. It is sad for this nation that we are not able to recognise these brave people.

I am not standing up to glorify Afzal Guru. I believe in democracy honestly. I believe that modern human intellect till the 21st century has not, as yet, thrown up any better system of governance if we see across the world any better system of governance than democracy. I know; we all know; we are all parts, a little molecules in this whole system. We all know that there are lots of discrepancies, lots of shortcomings and disappointments. Even we are disappointed with ourselves, with our own performances.

(g3/1635/ksp/vb)

But yet, we all recognize that today modern man has not yet evolved and brought about a better system of governance than democracy. So, when you have a scoundrel by the name of Afzal Guru who dares to come and attack this temple which is sacrosanct, there can be but killings and there can only be hanging which is the result that we saw. The very system that he wanted to destroy, that system allowed him to breathe for 11 years, 1 month and 11 days after he was nabbed for this dastardly attack. That very system allowed him to go on appeal from one court to the other court till the Supreme Court; that democracy allowed him to go on a clemency petition to the President which also elongated his lifespan. The man that scoundrel did not have that much of understanding how great this system is and the Parliament is. There should be no mercy shown for people of that level. Absolutely I am certain about that. Yet, there are those amongst us who glorify a person like Afzal Guru and, directly or indirectly, they are willing to stand

shoulder to shoulder with those very people who say that we want to break up this country. ... *(Interruptions)* Hang on, please wait, have patience, it is coming. ... *(Interruptions)* They have no shame to align themselves and go to the university. Unfortunately Sir, you, your Government, have shut down the water supply for the last six days. ... *(Interruptions)* You have stopped water supply to the JNU Campus. ... *(Interruptions)* Don't say no; you are aware of it, don't say no. ... *(Interruptions)*

Madam, I would like to bring back the discussion on track. In this whole pell-mell of confusion, in our desperateness to politicize on one side Rohit Vemula issue, nobody said that whether he is Backward or whether he is Scheduled Caste or Dalit or an Upper Caste Brahmin, that does not matter, he was a young man of India. Nobody is bothered about that because these people want to politicize on that and those people, sitting there, they want to politicize on the 'us and them' issue and, so nobody is better Madam. They are all on equal footing. We lost sight of this critical anti-India movement because you lost sight, you forgot that trying to propagate, trying to help a bunch of students with political ambitions, a bunch of non-students who entered the university premises, trying to support their political ambitions, you lost track of the greater picture as to how, within a campus, an anti-India movement is being built up, a campus that is funded by the tax-payer of this country.

Then, on the other hand, if you look at the very country that they were idolizing and now you are idolizing, the US, if you look back, a couple of months ago, in the University of Missouri, the African-American students, the coloured students, in that university raised slogans against the US and the words that they used were 'discreet racism', how their faculty, their fellow students, everybody was a racist and how they were punished for that.

(h3/1640/rcp/rps)

It has happened in the US and the Government tolerated it. It spread throughout many universities. The Government there tolerated and handled it with



kid gloves. This problem in the JNU could have been handled better. This is not the first year that they are doing it. After the hanging in 2014 of Afzal Guru, in 2015 also a similar documentary screening, a similar discussion was held in the JNU. But at that time, this bunch of young people who are now for some political recognition, they did not exist in the JNU. The so-called Leftists who raised slogans against India, they were present. And because they were larger in number, there was nothing that the Government could do. But this time through, when a small, little spider went up and got one single post, then the Government got worried and then the Government suddenly thought of nationalism. So, when I think of nationalism, I remember Benito Mussolini, Italy; I remember Adolf Hitler and his national socialists. That is nationalism for me. But if you ask me, as an Indian, I am a patriot. I love my country. But then I cannot ask you or anybody else that if you love your country, you love me. I have no rights for that. Nobody owns this country. This country is owned by all of us. All of us are temporary; all of us are here for a short while; but this country is for all of us.

When frauds, dressed as lawyers, attacked students, beat up professors, beat up journalists, the police – the face of the Union Government because this was Delhi Police – stood as a mute spectator. Today, that is why, because of your mal-intentions, people are questioning your veracity, your honesty. It is not because you are Indians; nobody questions you on that front. Nobody questions your love for the country. But people question your intentions.

The educated in India is now in double minds and you put them in that situation. They were very clearly in your favour at the initial stages. When people saw those doctored television broadcasts, they all supported you. But your actions damaged your own cause. The way the police was seen standing as mute spectator, the way that the Commissioner started speaking, the way the hon. Home Minister started quoting tweets of all things, tweets are gossips and your label somebody as a terrorist because of some tweets. Terrorism is something that is punishable by death. So when you made these mistakes, you turned the country

upside down, you confused those same people who wanted to support you, please remember that these acts of yours have created a severe loss of confidence on the establishment amongst the youth and the students.

I would also request you to remember that the Government or the system of governance should welcome criticism. When your faults are thrown up at your face, you have an opportunity to rectify it. When you shy away from looking at your own faults, you do not realise what is happening till 2019 hits you from the head. Then it will be too late. This country needs action now, not police action. You cannot deal with this country, with the students of this country, with the youths of this country by beating them up with goons, black shirts, grey shirts, the Schutzstaffeln and the police. You have to deal with them as a civilized society and a civilized Government.

(j3/1645/rp-jr)

Madam, I will speak just a few more words. Unfortunately, we are all aware that the story does not end here. The story, actually, starts here. How does it start? Where lies the problem? It is not so much Afzal Guru who actually bothers you. Let me be very honest. That 'us' and 'them' divide, *khaki* or *non-khaki*, that also does not really bother you. You are in seat of power. What bothers you is the appalling economic system in this country and the appalling economic situation in this country. Your banks have collapsed. The Rupee is dipping 6.6 per cent in a few days time. On February 23rd it was Rs. 68 to a Dollar. By yesterday, it had reached Rs. 70 to a Dollar.

I also love travelling abroad. Given an opportunity, I would travel any time. But despite that I keep in touch with my country, with my State and with my constituency. I do not forget my nation when I travel abroad. The State Bank's record is damned by the Punjab National Bank. The Punjab National Bank's NPAs have been outdone by the Bank of Baroda's NPAs. If we see bank-by-bank, it is not bank nationalisation that is to blame, it is the present day administration that is to blame.

HON. SPEAKER: Please conclude now.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI TATHAGATA SATPATHY (DHENKANAL): I would beseech your attention Madam. A Bench headed by the Chief Justice of India in the Supreme Court recently asked the Government lawyer. I am quoting the Chief Justice's words:

“People are owing thousands of crore to the public banks... it is a big fraud. Top ten public sector banks have written off Rs. 40,000 crore alone in 2015. It is all there in newspaper reports. Public financial institutions are lending money despite knowing no returns...What are you doing about it? ”

So, this is a kind of situation. ... (*Interruptions*) This is not a tweet. This is from the Supreme Court. ... (*Interruptions*)

HON. SPEAKER: Tathagata Satpathy ji, conclude your speech now.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI TATHAGATA SATPATHY (DHENKANAL): Yes. These economic mishandlings, the total callousness and the total inaptness of this Government has disillusioned the youth of this country, has disillusioned the students of this country. They do not think the future of this nation is safe in the hands of these people or those people. They throw them out. Now, they are waiting for their opportunity to deal with them. The country is under dire economic stress. The Government should make their citizens honestly aware of what their responsibilities are. You cannot hide under the fuel excise. Just because the petrol prices are low, you are making some money out of it. That is a temporary benefit. Eventually, when this boomer ends, you may not be around but the country will be around.

I would suggest that the time has come that the Government of the day comes clean and tells the people what the situation is. Let us not hide behind smoke screens of agitations for reservations and student troubles. All those are the

things of the past which these people used and failed. Let us not replicate their moves. Find new ways. Be honest with the citizens. Come out clean and tell the citizens what you expect from them. Thank you.

(ends)

(k3/1650/mm/lh)

माननीय अध्यक्ष : मेरा निवेदन है कि अब जितने भी माननीय सदस्य बोलेंगे, वह तीन-चार मिनट में अपनी बात समाप्त करेंगे। हमें समय का ध्यान रखना है।



1650 बजे

श्री अरविंद सावंत (मुम्बई दक्षिण) : अध्यक्ष जी, मैं बहुत दुखः और कष्ट से आज बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। व्यथित हूँ, क्योंकि दर्दभरी घटनाएं इस देश में होती जा रही हैं। एक दिन नहीं, रोज़ाना हम देख रहे हैं कि आतंकवादियों के हमले हो रहे हैं और जवान शहीद हो रहे हैं। रोज़ाना नागरिकों पर हमले हो रहे हैं। देश में जो घटनाएं हो रही हैं, हर एक व्यक्ति जो यहां बैठा है, उसको अंतर्मुख होकर उसको देखना चाहिए।

मैंने सभी माननीय सदस्यों के भाषण सुने। कुछ विद्वतापूर्ण थे। कुछ विषय को लेकर अलग ढंग से बात कर रहे थे। जवाहर लाल युनिवर्सिटी में जो हुआ, उसके पहले तेलंगाना में हैदराबाद युनिवर्सिटी में जो घटना हुई, उससे हमें दर्द पहुंचा है। एक जवान बच्चा, रिसर्च करने वाला, पीएचडी करने वाला, आत्महत्या करता है, यह अच्छी बात नहीं है। जब जवाहर लाल युनिवर्सिटी की बात आयी तो मैं बहुत गर्व से उसकी तरफ देख रहा था। वर्ष 1969 में उसकी स्थापना हुई। इस युनिवर्सिटी में बहुत सारी फ़ैकल्टी है। जवाहर लाल युनिवर्सिटी में डेमोक्रेटिक स्टूडेंट्स फ़ेडरेशन, एआईएसएफ और इसी तरह की तीन चार छात्रों के संगठन हैं। अफ़ज़ल गुरु की तीसरी बरसी पर वहां सांस्कृतिक संध्या का आयोजन हुआ। यह मुझे वाकई दर्द देता है कि अफ़ज़ल गुरु के लिए आप सांस्कृतिक संध्या करते हैं और उसमें नारे लगाते हैं- “हम क्या चाहें आज़ादी। हक़ हमारा, आज़ादी। लड़कर लेंगे, आज़ादी। कश्मीर मांगे, आज़ादी।” जवाहर लाल युनिवर्सिटी में आप पढ़ने के लिए आए हैं और वहां इस तरह के नारे लगा रहे हैं। हम सारे लोग फ्रीडम की बात करते हैं। मुझे समझ में नहीं आया कि हम स्कूल और कॉलेजों में क्यों जाते हैं? हम किस की आजादी मांग रहे हैं? हम वहां पढ़ने के लिए आए हैं। यदि हम वहां पढ़ने के लिए आए हैं तो पढ़ने की बजाय हम अलग विषय की तरफ जा रहे हैं। आगे चलकर उन्होंने वहां कहा- “कश्मीर की आजादी तक जंग रहेगी जंग। भारत की बर्बादी तक जंग रहेगी जंग।” इससे क्या आप लोगों को सदमा नहीं लगता है? हम डेमोक्रेसी की बात करते हैं। यह संगठन मकबूल भट्ट की बात करता है। उस मकबूल भट्ट की मैं आज आपको याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ। 14 सितम्बर, 1966 में पाकिस्तान के साथ हाथ मिलाकर मकबूल भट्ट ने पुलिस पर हमला किया। इंस्पेक्टर अमरचंद मारा गया। मकबूल भट्ट ने वर्ष 1971 में इंडियन एयरलाइंस विमान का अपहरण किया। उसका मुख्य संचालन भी मकबूल भट्ट ने ही किया। वर्ष 1976 में भारत की फौज ने उसे पकड़ लिया। 3 फरवरी, 1984 को जम्मू-कश्मीर लिबरेशन फ्रंट, उनके ऊपर मुकद्मा चलता रहा। उसे फांसी की सजा हुई। फांसी की सजा होने के बाद उन्होंने राष्ट्रपति को माफी के लिए अर्जी दी। वर्ष 1984 में रवींद्र म्हात्रे जी कांस्युलेट में काम करते थे। उनका अपहरण कर लिया गया और यह मांग की गयी कि मकबूल भट्ट को छोड़ दो। इंदिरा गांधी जी उस समय देश की प्रधानमंत्री थीं। उन्होंने कहा कि हम

आतंकवादियों के सामने नहीं झुक सकते हैं। चार दिन बाद मकबूल भट्ट के लोगों ने रवीन्द्र म्हात्रे की हत्या की और रास्ते पर उसका शव फेंक दिया।

(13/1655/bks-kkd)

चार फरवरी को उसकी हत्या करने के बाद तीन दिन के अंदर उस वक्त प्रधान मंत्री, श्रीमती इंदिरा गांधी जी ने जो अर्जी राष्ट्रपति महोदय के सामने दी थी, उन्होंने राष्ट्रपति जी से विनती की कि आप अर्जी पर फैसला दीजिए, फैसले के मुताबिक राष्ट्रपति ने उसकी अर्जी मान्य नहीं की और 11 फरवरी को मकबूल भट्ट को फांसी दी गई। 1984 में उसे फांसी दी गई और आज तक वे लोग मकबूल भट्ट को भूले नहीं हैं, जबकि हम रवीन्द्र म्हात्रे को भूल गये। हम सियाचिन की बात करते हैं, हम हनुमनथप्पा को भूलेंगे, हम पठानकोट की हत्या को भूलेंगे, लेकिन आजादी के नाम पर, डेमोक्रेसी के नाम पर छात्र कुछ भी नारे लगायें, उनका हम समर्थन करेंगे। मुझे बहुत बुरा लग रहा है, आप उनका समर्थन करते हो। आप किस बात का समर्थन कर रहे हो, इसमें राजनीति चल रही है। देश में एक नई सरकार आई, हां ठीक है, सरकार से भी कुछ गलतियां होती हैं। मैं यह नहीं कहता हूं कि आप उसकी आलोचना न करें, आप उसकी जरूर आलोचना करो, लेकिन देश की अखंडता पर अगर कोई आंच आती है तब हम सबको मिलकर उसके खिलाफ लड़ना चाहिए। लेकिन वह नहीं हो रहा है, आज हम बता रहे हैं कि तुमने क्या किया, हमने क्या किया। हम यहां दोनों की लड़ाई देख रहे हैं। मुझे बहुत बुरा लग रहा है, मैं बहुत व्यथित हूं। जवाहर लाल नेहरू यूनिवर्सिटी में जो हादसा हुआ, वह क्यों हुआ?

इसके बाद मैं दो-तीन महत्वपूर्ण चीजें बताना चाहता हूं कि यह कहां से शुरू हुआ। ये सारी घटनाएं नक्सलवाद से जुड़ी हुई हैं, लेफ्टिस्ट्स हैं, लेफ्टिस्ट होना कोई गलत नहीं है, लेकिन लेफ्टिस्ट होकर देश की अखंडता पर आंच लाना गलत है। यह कब हुआ, जब रशिया डाउन हुआ और चाइना ने पूंजीवाद स्वीकारा तो पता चलने लगा कि क्या करें। आज यह जो पूरा अड्डा बना है, वह माओवादियों का अड्डा है। जवाहर लाल यूनिवर्सिटी अलगाववादियों का अड्डा बन गया है। गृह मंत्री जी से मेरी प्रार्थना है, क्या हमारी इंटेलिजेंस कमजोर पड़ रही है? पठानकोट में भी अटैक हुआ। जवाहर लाल नेहरू यूनिवर्सिटी में हमने बच्चों को पकड़ क्या लिया, सेडिशन के ऊपर अभी डेफिनिशन चल रही है। हां सही बात है कि सेडिशन का जो मुद्दा था, वह मुद्दा जब अंग्रेजों की सरकार थी तो जो लोग देश के लिए लड़ रहे थे तो उन सबके ऊपर सेडिशन लगाया जाता था। सब पर 124(अ) धारा लगाई जाती थी। उसे लेकर हम आज इस तरह से कर रहे हैं। युवा इस देश की ताकत है। हमें यह नहीं भूलना चाहिए कि हमारे मुम्बई में इशरत जहां का एक हादसा हुआ था। आपको याद है, वह लड़की मारी गई, वह किसलिए आई थी, यह सबको पता है। तब सारी सरकार के लोग उसके पीछे खड़े रहे, कोर्ट तक गये। आज हेडली के द्वारा पता चला कि इशरत जहां प्रधान